Why Evaluate?
Indigenous Evaluation Frameworks

2nd Annual Conference on Native American Nutrition
Prior Lake, MN
September 18, 2017

Donald Warne, MD, MPH
Oglala Lakota
Chair, Department of Public Health
Mary J. Berg Distinguished Professor of Women’s Health
Traditional View of Public Health
What is Public Health?

• “the fulfillment of society’s interest in assuring the conditions in which people can be healthy”¹

• Achieved through the application of health promotion and disease prevention technologies and interventions designed to improve and enhance quality of life²

¹Institute of Medicine, The Future of Public Health
²Association of Schools of Public Health
Ten Essential Services

- Evaluate
- Monitor
- Investigate
- Educate
- Mobilize
- Policy & Planning
- Enforce
- Link
- Assure
- Support Management

Assurance

Assessment

Policy Development

Research
PUBLIC HEALTH INTERVENTIONS SEEK TO CREATE OR FACILITATE POSITIVE BEHAVIORS

At the individual or community level

Policy, systems and environmental changes still seek to ultimately impact individual or community behavior
EVALUATION...

Helps us to understand the relationships and effectiveness of intervention design
Levels of Evaluation

• Formative
  – Takes place before or during a project's implementation with the aim of improving the project's design and performance

• Process
  – Assessment of how a program is being implemented

• Outcome
  – Assessment of the changes that have taken place

• Impact
  – Assessment of longer term changes
Process

- **Process Monitoring**
  - Describing who received your services and the resources it took
  - “How many…?”

- **Process Evaluation**
  - Seeks to understand if your intervention was delivered as intended and the quality of delivery
Outcome

• Outcome Monitoring
  – What changes took place after the conclusion of your intervention?

• Outcome Evaluation
  – Can changes be attributed to your intervention?
Evaluation in a Cultural Context

Helps us to understand the processes and effectiveness of intervention design
MEDICINE WHEEL

NORTH

WEST  EAST

SOUTH
MEDICINE WHEEL

MENTAL

PHYSICAL

SPIRITUAL

EMOTIONAL
MEDICINE WHEEL & Determinants of Public Health

EDUCATIONAL

ENVIRONMENTAL  CULTURAL

SOCIAL
MEDICINE WHEEL

DECISIONS

ACTIONS

VALUES

REACTIONS
MEDICINE WHEEL & Program Evaluation

PLAN

IMPLEMENT

ENVISION

EVALUATE
MEDICINE WHEEL & Program Evaluation

PLAN

ENVISION

IMPLEMENT

EVALUATE
MEDICINE WHEEL & Program Evaluation

- ENVISION
- PLAN
- IMPLEMENT
- EVALUATE

MEDICINE WHEEL & Program Evaluation

- ENVISION
- PLAN
- IMPLEMENT
- EVALUATE
MEDICINE WHEEL & Program Evaluation

ENVISION

IMPLEMENT

PLAN

ENVISION

EVALUATE

EVALUATE
MEDICINE WHEEL & Program Evaluation

PLAN

IMPLEMENT

ENVISION

EVALUATE
MEDICINE WHEEL & Program Evaluation

Opportunity to document and share results.

Mitakutye Oyasin!
MEDICINE WHEEL & Program Evaluation

PLAN

IMPLEMENT

ENVISION

EVALUATE
What Works in Public Health?

• **Evidence Based Practice**—using the best available evidence to make informed public health practice decisions.

• **Best Practice**—PH programs, interventions, and policies that have been evaluated, shown to be successful, and have the potential to be adapted and transformed by others working in the same field.
What Works in Public Health?

• **Emerging Practice**—Incorporates the philosophy, values, characteristics, and indicators of other positive/effective public health interventions.

• **Promising Practice**—Has strong quantitative and qualitative data showing positive outcomes, but does not yet have enough research or replication to support generalizable positive public health outcomes.
Need for AI PH “Evidence-Based Practices”

• Whose evidence is it?
Need for AI PH “Evidence-Based Practices”

• Whose evidence is it?

• Do current EBPs work in tribal communities?
Need for AI PH “Evidence-Based Practices”

• Whose evidence is it?

• Do current EBPs work in tribal communities?

• Examples from Tobacco Control and Diabetes Prevention.
Need for AI PH “Evidence-Based Practices”

Tobacco Control Strategies

• 100% Tobacco & Smoke Free

• Is this culturally competent?

• Does one-size fit all?
Need for AI PH “Evidence-Based Practices”

Diabetes Prevention Strategies

- What are they?
Need for AI PH “Evidence-Based Practices”

Diabetes Prevention Strategies
• Access to healthy food?
Need for AI PH “Evidence-Based Practices”

Diabetes Prevention Strategies

- Access to healthy food?
- Access to safe places to exercise?
Need for AI PH “Evidence-Based Practices”

**Diabetes Prevention Strategies**
- Access to healthy food?
- Access to safe places to exercise?
- Cultural factors?
Need for AI PH “Evidence-Based Practices”

How do we know what works in Indian Country?

• Research
• Evaluation
• How?
Promising Programs
Knowledge Building

- Build on existing research, evaluation, knowledge.
- Participatory framework
- Place matters! Social determinants of health/indigenous indicators
How do we Build an American Indian Evidence Base in Public Health?

• Research and Evaluation
  • Challenges? Opportunities?
• How do we identify potential programs?
• What are the priority areas?
  • Diabetes, tobacco, research, cancer…
• How do we disseminate information?
  • Publications? Conferences? (NIHB PH Summit?) Websites?
• Next Steps?
Evaluation of Tribal SHIP and Tribal Tobacco Grants in MN

AMERICAN INDIAN PUBLIC HEALTH RESOURCE CENTER
North Dakota State University
• The Minnesota Legislature made available state SHIP funds (Minn. Stat. §145.986) to tribal governments for the following purpose:
  • To address commercial tobacco use and exposure, poor diet, and lack of regular physical activity in the community, school, worksite or health care settings through a policy, systems and environmental approach.
The mission is to address American Indian public health disparities through:

- Technical Assistance
- Policy Development
- Tribal Self-Determination
- Education
- Research
- Programming

In partnership with tribal communities in ND, the Northern Plains, and across the nation.
AIPHRC uses a four-pronged, team-based approach in providing TA around PH policy, education, research, and services.

Technical assistance services include:
- Grant Writing
- Cultural and Tribal Public Health Capacity Building
- Research and Evaluation
- Stakeholder Group/Coalition Development and Recruitment
- Facilitation Services
Dr. Donald Warne (Oglala Lakota), Director/Chair, Department of Public Health

Dr. Melanie Nadeau (Turtle Mountain Band of Chippewa), Operational Director

Ryan Eagle (Mandan, Hidatsa, Arikara Nation), Research Project Manager

Vanessa Tibbitts (Oglala Lakota), Public Health Education Project Manager

Karla Checo, Public Health Coordinator

Pearl Walker-Swaney (Standing Rock & White Earth Band of Ojibwe), INBRE Project Manager

Gretchen Dobervich, Public Health Policy Project Manager
AIPHRC TRIBAL ENGAGEMENT

• Tribal engagement is at the core of all of our activities.
• AIPHRC’s Tribal Advisory Committee is composed of representatives from each of the five tribes in North Dakota and two from the National Indian Health Board.
• Tribal Advisory Committee helps to ensure that AIPHRC activities are appropriately responding to the public health needs of our tribal communities and in identifying opportunities for future activities.
TRIBAL SHIP EVALUATION GOALS

1. Engage 10 Minnesota Tribes to develop evaluation plans for each Tribal SHIP and Tobacco Program.
2. Assist grantees in identifying data collection methods for their evaluation activities and assist with development of data collection tools, including qualitative and quantitative tools and methods.
3. Assist grantees with preparing individual evaluation reports, including progress reports and a final summary for each grantee.
4. Summarize grantee evaluation progress for legislative updates, to be used by MDH to brief state legislators.
5. Work in partnership with MDH, other technical assistance providers, and the statewide evaluation workgroup.
EVALUATION ACTIVITIES

Goal 1
- Meet with each Tribal SHIP and Tobacco Grantees
- Work with Tribal Grantees to develop Communication Plan
- Schedule ongoing tribal site visits

Goal 2
- Work with Tribal Grantees to identify stakeholders
- Identify effective stakeholder engagement strategies
- Schedule stakeholder evaluation planning meetings with each Tribal Grantee

Goal 3
- Work with Tribal Grantees to develop Evaluation Plan(s)
- Assist Tribal Grantees and Stakeholders with prioritization of evaluation activities, identifying at least 1 focus area for more in-depth analysis

Goal 4
- Provide Evaluation Training to Tribal Grantees
- Create report templates, presentation templates, and consistent reporting methods
- Develop process for coordinating Evaluation Reports
- Provide Technical Assistance to Tribal Grantees on an ongoing basis

Goal 5
- Work with each Tribal Grantee to obtain Evaluation Progress Reports for SHIP Report
- Develop Evaluation Progress Reports for Legislative updates
FRAMEWORK CORE CULTURAL VALUES

People of a Place

Recognizing our Gifts

Tribal Sovereignty

Community and Family
PEOPLE OF A PLACE

• In *God Is Red*, Vine Deloria writes about sacred places:

  The vast majority of Indian tribal religions...have a sacred center at a particular place, be it a river, a mountain, a plateau, valley, or other natural feature. This center enables the people to look out along the four dimensions and locate their lands, to relate all historical events within the confines of this particular land, and to accept responsibility for it. Regardless of what subsequently happens to the people, the sacred lands remain as permanent fixtures in their cultural and religious understanding. -- Deloria, Jr., V., *God Is Red*, Fulcrum Publishing, Golden, CO, 1994, p. 67.
CULTURAL VALUES AND EVALUATION PRACTICE

- Exploring and naming our values is a first step in developing an Indigenous approach to evaluation.
- Our programs are place-based and must be designed and evaluated in ways that understand our connections to place.
- We recognize the unique gifts of everyone and cannot be limited to using only narrow measures of merit or achievement to assess learning.
- Community is central to our sense of ourselves as a people and should be considered in our evaluation practice.
- Sovereignty dictates that evaluation belongs to the tribe and community and should be practiced in ways that help us learn and move forward.
CREATING YOUR STORY

• A program is a story
• There is a proposed story and a story that unfolds through implementation
• **Evaluation tracks the journey between the proposed story and the actual story**
• Creating the story we hope to tell is the first step of evaluation
INDIGENOUS EVALUATION STORY CREATION

• Consider the values that are important in your community and which should be connected to evaluation

• Recognize the relationships in the program – people, activities, outcomes

• Put these within a model or metaphor that communicates within your community
OBSERVATION OF ENVIRONMENT

- Attendance
- Scores and ratings
- Criterion referenced measures
- Tallies of survey responses
- Rubric scores of demonstrations
- Retention scores
- Completion or graduation rates
- Formal observations
Indigenous Evaluation:

- Uses both qualitative and quantitative methods
- Measures experience over time
- Looks at information from multiple perspectives
WHAT ARE LEGISLATORS AND FUNDING AGENCIES LOOKING FOR?

• Why did this money need to be spent? What problem are you trying to solve and why is it a problem?
• How much state, federal, tribal, private foundation dollars did your project receive?
• How was the money spent?
• What approaches were successful?
• What approaches were not successful?
• How many people did you serve?
• What are the short and long term impacts of this investment?
• What is specifically needed to continue the success of the project? How will it become sustainable, if need be?
THANK YOU!

https://www.ndsu.edu/centers/american_indian_health/

Dr. Donald Warne – donald.warne@ndsu.edu
Dr. Melanie Nadeau – melanie.nadeau@ndsu.edu
Vanessa Tibbitts – vanessa.tibbitts@ndsu.edu
Ryan Eagle – ryan.eagle@ndsu.edu
Gretchen Dobervich – gretchen.dobervich@ndsu.edu
Karla Checo – karla.checo@ndsu.edu

701-231-6269